

27 / 2 / 18

Further Proof Techniques - Lesson 3

Proof by Contraposition and Proof by Contradiction

LI

- Know the contrapositive of a statement.
- Prove statements using Proof by Contraposition.
- Prove statements using Proof by Contradiction.

SC

- Logical reasoning.

The negation of A is ' $\text{not } A$ '

The contrapositive of the statement $A \Rightarrow B$
is the statement ' $\text{not } B \Rightarrow \text{not } A$ '

The contrapositive of a statement is logically equivalent to the original statement; thus, to prove $A \Rightarrow B$, we can prove ' $\text{not } B \Rightarrow \text{not } A$ ' (often easier)

Proof by Contraposition (aka Proof by Contrapositive) is a proof technique that involves proving $A \Rightarrow B$ by proving ' $\text{not } B \Rightarrow \text{not } A$ '

Proof by Contradiction is a proof technique that involves proving $A \Rightarrow B$ by assuming A and ' $\text{not } B$ ', then reaching a contradiction (usually, ' $\text{not } A$ ')

Notation

\mathbb{N} - set of all natural numbers.

\mathbb{W} - set of all whole numbers.

\mathbb{Z} - set of all integers.

\mathbb{Q} - set of all rational numbers.

\mathbb{R} - set of all real numbers (all rational and irrational numbers).

\mathbb{C} - set of all complex numbers.

Example 1

Prove by contraposition that : n^2 odd \Rightarrow n odd ($n \in \mathbb{Z}$).

Assume the negation of ' n odd'; i.e. assume that n is even.

Then $\exists k \in \mathbb{Z}$ such that $n = 2k$. Hence,

$$n^2 = (2k)^2$$

$$\Rightarrow n^2 = 4k^2$$

$$\Rightarrow \underline{n^2 = 2(2k^2)}$$

As $k \in \mathbb{Z}$, $2k^2 \in \mathbb{Z}$; hence n^2 is even. So, n even $\Rightarrow n^2$ even.

By contraposition, n^2 odd $\Rightarrow n$ odd

Example 2

Prove by contraposition : $x^2 - 6x + 5$ even $\Rightarrow x$ odd ($x \in \mathbb{Z}$).

Assume the negation of 'x odd'; i.e. assume that x is even.

Then $\exists k \in \mathbb{Z}$ such that $x = 2k$. Hence,

$$\begin{aligned}x^2 - 6x + 5 &= (2k)^2 - 6(2k) + 5 \\ \Rightarrow x^2 - 6x + 5 &= 4k^2 - 12k + 4 + 1 \\ \Rightarrow x^2 - 6x + 5 &= 2(2k^2 - 6k + 2) + 1\end{aligned}$$

As $k \in \mathbb{Z}$, $2k^2 - 6k + 2 \in \mathbb{Z}$; hence $x^2 - 6x + 5$ is odd.

So, x even $\Rightarrow x^2 - 6x + 5$ odd.

By contraposition, $x^2 - 6x + 5$ even $\Rightarrow x$ odd

Example 3

Prove by contradiction : $\sqrt{2}$ is irrational.

Assume that $\sqrt{2}$ is rational. Then $\exists a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ($b \neq 0$) such that,

$$\sqrt{2} = \frac{a}{b}$$

where it can be assumed that a and b have no common factors; if they did, they can be cancelled out. Then,

$$a^2 = 2b^2 \Rightarrow a^2 \text{ is even} \Rightarrow \underline{a \text{ is even}}$$

$$\therefore a = 2k \text{ (} k \in \mathbb{Z} \text{)}$$

$$\Rightarrow 4k^2 = 2b^2$$

$$\Rightarrow b^2 = 2k^2 \Rightarrow b^2 \text{ is even} \Rightarrow \underline{b \text{ is even}}$$

Hence, both a and b are even; but this contradicts the fact that a and b were assumed to have no common factors. Hence, the starting assumption that $\sqrt{2}$ is rational is false.

By contradiction, $\sqrt{2}$ is irrational

Example 4

Prove by contradiction : x irrational $\Rightarrow x + 3$ irrational.

Assume that $x + 3$ is rational. Then $\exists a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ($b \neq 0$) such that,

$$x + 3 = \frac{a}{b}$$

$$\therefore x = \frac{a}{b} - 3$$

$$\Rightarrow x = \frac{a - 3b}{b}$$

As $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ($b \neq 0$), $a - 3b \in \mathbb{Z}$; hence, $x \in \mathbb{Q}$, contradicting the assumption that x is irrational.

By contradiction, x irrational $\Rightarrow x + 3$ irrational

Example 5

Prove by contradiction : $4 + 7\sqrt{3}$ is irrational. You may assume that $\sqrt{3}$ is irrational.

Assume that $4 + 7\sqrt{3}$ is rational. Then $\exists a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ($b \neq 0$) such that,

$$4 + 7\sqrt{3} = \frac{a}{b}$$

$$\therefore 7\sqrt{3} = \frac{a}{b} - 4$$

$$\Rightarrow 7\sqrt{3} = \frac{a - 4b}{b}$$

$$\Rightarrow \underline{\underline{\sqrt{3} = \frac{a - 4b}{7b}}}$$

As $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$, $a - 4b, 7b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ($7b \neq 0$); hence, $\sqrt{3} \in \mathbb{Q}$, contradicting the assumption that $\sqrt{3}$ is irrational.

By contradiction, $4 + 7\sqrt{3}$ is irrational

Questions

Prove by contraposition :

1) $n^2 \text{ even} \Rightarrow n \text{ even} (n \in \mathbb{Z}).$

2) $x^3 + 1 \text{ even} \Rightarrow x \text{ odd} (x \in \mathbb{Z}).$

3) $x^3 - 3 \text{ even} \Rightarrow x \text{ odd} (x \in \mathbb{Z}).$

4) $x^2 + 5x < 0 \Rightarrow x < 0 (x \in \mathbb{R}).$

Prove by contradiction :

5) $n^2 \text{ odd} \Rightarrow n \text{ odd} (n \in \mathbb{Z}).$

6) $n^2 \text{ even} \Rightarrow n \text{ even} (n \in \mathbb{Z}).$

7) $x \text{ irrational} \Rightarrow x - 8 \text{ irrational}.$

8) $\sqrt{7}$ is irrational.

9) $13 - 9\sqrt{7}$ is irrational (assume that $\sqrt{7}$ is irrational).